

Message

**From:** Goodrow, Sandra [Sandra.Goodrow@dep.nj.gov]  
**Sent:** 3/4/2020 9:29:53 PM  
**To:** Washington, John [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=fdc3e8ce9f1d45c4894881ff420ca104-Washington, John];  
[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)] McCord, James [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=McCord, James]; Strynar, Mark [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5a9910d5b38e471497bd875fd329a20a-Strynar, Mark]; Lindstrom, Andrew [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=04bf7cf26aa44ce29763fbc1c1b2338e-Lindstrom, Andrew]; Bergman, Erica [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=user69ab393b]; Tadesse, Haile [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=114d2e5f74bf4c958eff767e15479552-Tadesse, Ha]; Pilant, Drew [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=c9669a68dabb4704bdd7c2eb85f998b2-Pilant, Drew]; Washington, Benjamin [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=08c0a6a6ee7e4657a016cfb460ab570d-Washington,]; Davis, Mary J. [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=5a11c3a4da6248dfbaecd3465fe1ebc3-Davis, Mary]; Stuart, Brittany [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=6320e90a5ccd4554805142bc094c3026-Stuart, Brittany]; Thomas M Jenkins [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]  
**CC:** Stevens, Caroline [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=dfd9eb36db0a44eaa6cabf85f3cf0550-Stevens, Caroline]; Schumacher, Brian [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=c2d457e4a6684028801b188422df52a7-Schumacher, Brian]; Watkins, Tim [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4cbd1c572f584fd7b0a3b5945f118558-Watkins, Tim]; Gillespie, Andrew [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=dce99ece87694a06b3009d7756e2a89e-Gillespie, Andrew]  
**Subject:** RE: Update on status of Science submission

Thank you!

S

---

**From:** Washington, John <Washington.John@epa.gov>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 4, 2020 4:08 PM  
**To:** Goodrow, Sandra <Sandra.Goodrow@dep.nj.gov> [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]; McCord, James <mccord.james@epa.gov>; Strynar, Mark <Strynar.Mark@epa.gov>; Lindstrom, Andrew <Lindstrom.Andrew@epa.gov>; Bergman, Erica <Erica.Bergman@dep.nj.gov>; Tadesse, Haile <tadesse.haile@epa.gov>; Pilant, Drew <Pilant.Drew@epa.gov>; Washington, Benjamin <Washington.Benjamin@epa.gov>; Davis, Mary J. <davis.maryj@epa.gov>; Stuart, Brittany <Stuart.Brittany@epa.gov>; Thomas M Jenkins [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]  
**Cc:** Stevens, Caroline <Stevens.Caroline@epa.gov>; Schumacher, Brian <Schumacher.Brian@epa.gov>; Watkins, Tim <Watkins.Tim@epa.gov>; Gillespie, Andrew <Gillespie.Andrew@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] RE: Update on status of Science submission

---

**From:** Goodrow, Sandra <Sandra.Goodrow@dep.nj.gov>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 4, 2020 4:02 PM  
**To:** Washington, John <Washington.John@epa.gov> [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]; McCord, James <mccord.james@epa.gov>; Strynar, Mark <Strynar.Mark@epa.gov>; Lindstrom, Andrew <Lindstrom.Andrew@epa.gov>; Bergman, Erica

<erica.bergman@dep.nj.gov>; Tadesse, Haile <tadesse.haile@epa.gov>; Pilant, Drew <Pilant.Drew@epa.gov>; Washington, Benjamin <Washington.Benjamin@epa.gov>; Davis, Mary J. <davis.maryj@epa.gov>; Stuart, Brittany <Stuart.Brittany@epa.gov>; Thomas M Jenkins [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]  
**Cc:** Stevens, Caroline <Stevens.Caroline@epa.gov>; Schumacher, Brian <Schumacher.Brian@epa.gov>; Watkins, Tim <Watkins.Tim@epa.gov>; Gillespie, Andrew <Gillespie.Andrew@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Update on status of Science submission

Is this a paper you can share?

*Sandra M. Goodrow, Ph.D.*

Research Scientist I  
NJ Dept. of Environmental Protection  
Division of Science & Research  
428 E. State St., 1<sup>st</sup> Floor  
Mail Code 428-01, P.O. Box 420  
Trenton, NJ 08625-0420  
(609) 940-4164 *New Phone Number!*  
[Sandra.Goodrow@dep.nj.gov](mailto:Sandra.Goodrow@dep.nj.gov)



*NOTE: This e-mail is protected by the Electronic Communications Privacy Act, 18 U.S.C. Sections 2510-2521. This E-Mail and its contents may be Privileged & Confidential due to the Attorney-Client Privilege, Attorney Work Product, Deliberative Process or under the New Jersey Open Public Records Act.*

*If you are not the intended recipient of this e-mail, please notify the sender, delete it and do not read, act upon, print, disclose, copy, retain or redistribute it.*

---

**From:** Washington, John <Washington.John@epa.gov>

**Sent:** Wednesday, March 4, 2020 3:50 PM

**To:** [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)] Cord, James <mccord.james@epa.gov>; Strynar, Mark <Strynar.Mark@epa.gov>; Lindstrom, Andrew <Lindstrom.Andrew@epa.gov>; Bergman, Erica <Erica.Bergman@dep.nj.gov>; Goodrow, Sandra <Sandra.Goodrow@dep.nj.gov>; Tadesse, Haile <tadesse.haile@epa.gov>; Pilant, Drew <Pilant.Drew@epa.gov>; Washington, Benjamin <Washington.Benjamin@epa.gov>; Davis, Mary J. <davis.maryj@epa.gov>; Stuart, Brittany <Stuart.Brittany@epa.gov>; Thomas M Jenkins [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)] <>

**Cc:** Stevens, Caroline <Stevens.Caroline@epa.gov>; Schumacher, Brian <Schumacher.Brian@epa.gov>; Watkins, Tim <Watkins.Tim@epa.gov>; Gillespie, Andrew <Gillespie.Andrew@epa.gov>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] Update on status of Science submission

Hi co-authors,

Honesty is the best policy, but not always an inconsequential policy.

Mark Strynar found a synthesis paper in which a the chlorine position looks slightly different than we had seen reported in Wang et al. and EFSA. I explained this, and how I was working on altering the graphics, to the editor at Science. You can see his response.

I still am more optimistic for the future of this manuscript than before when you all received the author forms from Science.

Sorry for the not-great news and uncertainty,  
John

---

**From:** Jake Yeston <jyeston@aaas.org>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 4, 2020 3:32 PM  
**To:** Washington, John <Washington.John@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Update and question as to your preference

Hi John,

Thanks for the email. This Solvay paper seems to be fairly significant in the context of the claim that they didn't disclose the structures you uncovered. Have you looked carefully through the follow-up paper as well?  
<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0022113911000698>

I think for that reason, it would be much clearer to go back to the reviewers with all the proper structures depicted in the figures. There's really no great hurry on our end.

regards,

Jake

---

**From:** Washington, John <Washington.John@epa.gov>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 4, 2020 3:13 PM  
**To:** Jake Yeston <jyeston@aaas.org>  
**Subject:** Update and question as to your preference

Hi Jake,

I have addressed all your comments, save two. Specifically I have work to do on two figures (upon which you commented), Figure 1 of the generic molecule and Figure 2/S2 of the c'grams and mass spectra which have numerous molecular structures.

One of our co-authors found a CIPFPECA molecular-synthesis paper with more structural information than is available in our exhaustive mass-spectra efforts or the two literature sources we reference for structure (Zhanyun Wang et al. and EFSA). I am attaching this newly discovered paper. Based on this paper, we think the Cl(CF<sub>2</sub>)O- moiety has a slightly different structure than shown in our draft and different than shown in our literature references.

In an effort to be accurate on Figs 1, 2 and S2, I have to work with our graphics expert, who has no chemistry expertise, by email/phone – a painstaking process. Optimistically, I estimate that he might be done reworking the figures next week.

So what is your preference:

- 1) Wait until the figures are complete and resubmit at that time even though otherwise I am done editing;
- 2) Resubmit the draft to you informally now via email, along with all my annotated responses to your comments;  
or
- 3) Resubmit now thru the Science portal, with a few-sentence explanation that Figs 1, 2 and S2 will be coming soon?

In absence of instructions from you otherwise, my default will be option 1. I just did not want you to think I was procrastinating.

It has been mayhem here in EPA with this manuscript, NJDEP and the EPA Region 2 staff (NJ is in EPA Region 2). And the EPA people working on several similar facilities at other locations won't leave me alone either. So I very much appreciate you having been patient.

Thanks,  
John

---

**From:** Jake Yeston <[jyeston@aaas.org](mailto:jyeston@aaas.org)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, March 3, 2020 3:46 PM  
**To:** Washington, John <[Washington.John@epa.gov](mailto:Washington.John@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: revised figure

You do want that C- (not O-) on the 3<sup>rd</sup> structure from the left? Just double-checking. I think it looks great too otherwise.

**From:** Washington, John <[Washington.John@epa.gov](mailto:Washington.John@epa.gov)>  
**Sent:** 02 March 2020 21:53  
**To:** Jake S. Yeston <[science\\_editors@aaas.org](mailto:science_editors@aaas.org)>  
**Subject:** FW: revised figure

Hi Jake,

Please let me know if the attached draft needs any further modification. I think it looks great.

John

---

**From:** Soderlind, Paul <[Soderlind.Paul@epa.gov](mailto:Soderlind.Paul@epa.gov)>  
**Sent:** Monday, March 2, 2020 4:39 PM  
**To:** Washington, John <[Washington.John@epa.gov](mailto:Washington.John@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** revised figure

John, Here is the file with the CF3 notation.